101st Congress 2d Session

JOINT COMMITTEE PRINT

# COUNTRY REPORTS ON HUMAN RIGHTS PRACTICES FOR 1989

## REPORT

SUBMITTED TO THE

COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS
HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

AND THE

COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN RELATIONS U.S. SENATE

BY THE

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTIONS 116(d) AND 502B(b) OF THE FOREIGN ASSISTANCE ACT OF 1961, AS AMENDED



FEBRUARY 1990

Printed for the use of the Committees on Foreign Affairs and Foreign Relations of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively

## EL SALVADOR

lved to ask the nt with the ILO actions in nal Brewers Company

rmitted even while

on process is

ant disregard for Some observers are not in agreement isregard.

hout the country;

ry Labor

onstitution as well reports of forced ment to repeal luding compulsory rk stoppage.

rohibited by law ices such as nd 18 are required to rk. In practice, in pnomy which is y children under the , as shoeshiners, Rudimentary lly inadequate.

113

kweek, a 15-day oyer-provided raised to n wage is not f living for a worker minimum wage with responsible for . ions. The Social orcement, which is

El Salvador has a freely elected democratic government, with an executive branch headed by a president, a unicameral legislative assembly, and an independent, but politically appointed, judiciary. On June 1, for the first time in Salvadoran history, civilian control of the government passed from one political party to another following free and fair elections. Alfredo Cristiani of the Nationalist Republican Alliance (ARENA) party assumed the Presidency from the incumbent, Jose Napoleon Duarte of the Christian Democrats (PDC).

The Armed Forces of El Salvador (ESAF) total 56,000, including The Armed Forces of El Salvador (ESAF) total 56,000, including some 11,500 members of the police forces. There are three astional police entities, usually referred to as the security forces: the National Police, the National Guard, and the Treasury Police. The security forces are considered part of the armed forces. The National Police, National Guard, and Treasury Police report to the Vice Minister of Defense for Public Security.

gl Salvador has a mixed economy, and private property is generally respected. The country's economy is predominantly agricultural. Coffee accounts for 65 percent of foreign exchange earnings. The economy has experienced 6 years of modest growth, despite losses of nearly \$2 billion caused by as armed insurgency. The Farabundo Marti Front for National iberation (FMLN) follows a strategy of seeking to disrupt the operations of the economy: it holds traffic bans which sisrupt normal commercial activity; it extorts "war taxes" to raise income; and it has increasingly resorted to sabotage of economic targets. The group's stated goal is to worsen economic conditions in order to turn the population against the elected government. The FMLN's November 1989 offensive, dering which attacks were focused on San Salvador and other urban areas, caused nearly \$20 million worth of damage to

The FMLN has been engaged in an armed insurgency since 1980, dedicated to the violent overthrow of governments now regularly established through democratic processes. has an estimated 6,000 full-time combatants backed by a network of front groups, part-time militia, and urban commando cells. During much of 1989 the FMLN pursued a public policy of attempting to make the country "ungovernable" through increased urban bombings and assassinations of intellectuals, DIMOT FMLN members, mayors, and government ministers and beig families. The FMLN sought to thwart the democratic ections in March by threatening the lives of those who consistered the election process and those who transported neters to the polling places, and rejected a government case-fire during the election period. On the political cont, the FMLN offered in January and in September two coposals to negotiate an end to the conflict. For the first the the FMLN dropped demands for power sharing and cknowledged the validity of elections as a means to power; it pecifically called for postponement of the March elections.

Sinsistence on an unconstitutional delay in the elections its refusal to accept the Government's cease-fire proposal agreement on a proposal impossible. In September the made a new proposal; shortly thereafter the Government the FMLN agreed to permanent monthly meetings in an early to reach an end to the conflict and the FMLN's corporation into political life. Meetings were held in

## EL SALVADOR

September and in October. On November 11, the FMLN launched a nationwide offensive which left over 3,000 guerrillas, soldiers, and civilians dead and thousands more wounded. Nevertheless, the government delegation went to Caracas for the scheduled November 20 negotiating session, but the FMLN did not show up.

As the insurgency gathered strength in the early 1980's, members of the security forces repeatedly violated the human rights of their fellow citizens and were unquestionably involved in widespread death squad arrivities. Although abuses continue, successful investigation and prosecution efforts now mean that military personnel, including officers, cannot count themselves immune to prosecution. In March 1989 the military turned over two officers, three noncommissioned officers, and six soldiers to civilian authorities for prosecution resulting from the September 1988 massacre of 10 civilians in San Sebastian. In May an active duty officer in the armed forces was found guilty and sentenced for the 1987 murder of three men. In January 1990, Colonel Guillermo Alfredo Benavides Moreno, Commandant of the Military Academy and Overall Commander of units providing security to the Academy area, along with two lieutenants, a sub-lieutenant, and five other soldiers, was held in custody and charged with the slayings of six Jesuit priests, a housekeeper, and her daughter on the campus of the University of Central America on November 16.

Statistics kept by the American Embassy, aggregated for only the first 8 months of the year, do not show an increase in civilian political killings. Nevertheless, rightwing vigilantism continued to be a serious human rights concern. While intense investigation of some notable cases has produced information useful to the prosecution, in many cases it was unclear who the perpetrators were—rightwing vigilantes, the security forces, the FMLN, or common criminals taking advantage of the violent environment that has characterized the country in recent years.

The judicial process continued to be hindered by archaic procedures, inadequate facilities, intimidation of judges, and corruption. The FMLN's assassination of the Attorney General in April was an additional blow. Unfortunately, there was little progress in the prosecution of some key human rights cases during 1989. Although the military leadership showed somewhat greater cooperation in investigations of reported human rights abuses by members of the military, this attitude was not reflected in the lower ranks of the ESAF, where cooperation with civilian investigators is, at best, erratic

## RESPECT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

- Section 1 Respect for the Integrity of the Person, Including Freedom from:
  - a. Political and Other Extrajudicial Killing

The assassinations of the Jesuits, the Attorney General, and the Minister of the Presidency were among the numerous political and extrajudicial killings occurring during the year. Discerning a trend or pattern in the level of such violence is always difficult, the more so in 1989 with a guerrilla offensive beginning in November. The collection and classification of information on politically motivated

killings is inexact, and of trends in violence over the using a consistent method example, can easily be disperpetrators wishing to continue, a political motive: causing them to be classif

The November FMLN offensipolitical killings throug' August, the number of deatwhich may have been polit month; this compares with in 1987, 22 in 1986, 28 it in 1982, 444 in 1981, and some rural areas, it is 1 the full number of civili.

Of the 138 apparently pol noncombatants during the clearly to have been perprobably attributed to the military personnel; and i evidence to designate the the 138 victims were 42 caction between the FMLN as

In statistics maintained : murders in which a politi not be excluded, these deper month during 1988 to . first 8 months of 1989. showed that in the period average was 13, compared

There continued to be repto the military and policideaths of two young men, Parada, who were in the cubeyond the legally allowed military high command ordered two soldiers were chain custody and the other suspect charged, in a statthe country, that his actiwhich operated out of the First Brigade denied the cinvestigation at year's en

On August 22, a member of year-old high school stude ESAF apologized to the far responsible. In another c military detachment in Sor wounded seven. The Chief parents and promised to br to believe that the studer roadblock) to justice. Al way, by year's end no sole

On November 16, 1989, six daughter were murdered on campus (UCA). The victims UCA's Rector; Father Segun. Human Rights Institute; Fa

Antony

Judicial Process

the Government is ect advocates hip in a front not in itself lthough membership

required to
a doctor or nurse
gency-related
y the family of
The
procedures,
streatment of
in an effort to
ies.

ces detained uspicion of o two-thirds were formally d the remainder nile facility, or

∋vember several and other lents involving g the first 2 nvestigating ions of support ostly Catholics, ring this s institutions to domestic and rrests were ident Cristiani searching the other zation of the e November, one

lay order the 15 days under dence warrants is normally, ce. The judge 120 days for asser offenses, ing the case. aly followed, fons held in judicial

can, from the rant until the request that legal basis n on the case

#### EL SALVADOR

The Government does not recognize the FMLN as a belligerent power and so does not accord prisoner-of-war status to captured guerrillas; captured guerrillas are turned over to the civilian court system for criminal prosecution. In the case of a group of war-wounded and handicapped FMLN ex-combatants who occupied the National Cathedral and later the Mexican Embassy, the Salvadoran Government allowed them to leave the country to take advantage of offers of free medical care by passing an amnesty in the National Assembly. Forty-six of them departed for Cuba in October.

There are no provisions in the law for exile. Many leaders of the FMLN claim to be in exile, but it is self-imposed. Some of them could, however, be subject to arrest in El Salvador for participation in guerrilla operations if they were to return. Revolutionary Democratic Front (FDR a formal political ally of the FMLN) leader Reuben Zamora, who returned in 1988 from such an exile, left again in late 1989, alleging that the Government's vigorous counter-offensive against the FMLN placed him in jeopardy. He had earlier in the year been an active campaigner for his party in the March presidential election. Mr. Zamora returned to El Salvador in early 1990.

With regard to forced or compulsory labor, see Section 6.c.

#### e. Denial of Fair Public Trial

The Constitution stipulates that the judiciary, the Attorney General's office, and the Solicitor General's office (public defenders) are independent of the rest of the Government and each other. The Legislative Assembly chooses the Supreme Court justices for 5-year terms, the Attorney General for a 3-year term, and the Solicitor General for a 3-year term. The Constitution establishes the regular court system and provides for a special system should the Legislative Assembly enact a state of exception. The Assembly enacted legislation to invoke an indefinite state of exception on November 13, following the initiation of the FMLN offensive; under its terms, security forces are allowed to detain FMLN suspects for 15 days for interrogation before consigning them to the courts. The state of exception remained in effect as of year's end.

The Constitution provides that a person accused of a crime may have a lawyer present upon being arraigned, but the right is seldom used, probably because few arrestees can afford to hire a private attorney. Court-appointed attorneys are not generally available to a defendant until the investigative phase is over and the judge determines there is sufficient evidence to enter the final, or plenary, stage of the trial. The defendant has a right to be present in court and to confront the witnesses that testify against him. All trial records of adults are open to the public unless the judge rules that the case be kept confidential. An appeal process exists and is used regularly.

Most major crimes in El Salvador are tried publicly before a five-person jury. Absences of attorneys, the destruction of many court buildings in the October 1986 earthquake, and a practically nonfunctioning jury identification and notification system hinder the ability of the judicial system to process cases expeditiously. Corruption and intimidation by political extremists are also factors. As a result, only 10 percent of the 2,058 prison inmates in September were serving sentences; the rest were awaiting adjudication of

## EL SALVADOR

their cases. Bail is available for some minor offenses, but is seldom used. Prisoners are usually incarcerated for 6 to 18 months from the time they are charged until they are brought to trial, and even longer waits are common.

Historically, civilian judicial authority has not extended to the military officer corps. Many low-ranking members of the military and police have been discharged and turned over to the civilian courts for trial on criminal charges, but, traditionally, officers of the armed and security forces have been treated differently from other citizens before the law. Judges are frequently reluctant to bring charges against them, and colleagues often fail to cooperate in the prosecution of crimes imputed to a fellow officer. This pattern began to change in 1989 with efforts to prosecute a major and a lieutenant accused of the 1988 San Sebastian killings and the conviction and sentencing of Lieutenant Rivas in the murders in Santa Ana (Section 1.a.).

f. Arbitrary Interference with Privacy, Family, Home, or Correspondence

The Government generally does not interfere arbitrarily in the personal lives of citizens, although the Constitution allows it the right to intervene when it believes national security is threatened. Both the Government and the guerrillas use networks of informants. According to the Constitution, before entering a private dwelling the security forces must have the inhabitant's consent, a judicial warrant, or reasonable belief that a crime is being or will be committed. In practice, the security forces often use forced entry to carry out arrests and investigations. Government forces often intercept mail deliveries in the conflictive zones. Wiretapping of telephone communications by the Government, the FMLN, private individuals, and political parties is widespread. The Government was accused in late November of indiscriminately entering the premises of religious and humanitarian organizations, conducting mass arrests, and seizing property found on the premises. Government officials asserted that military forces were acting on intelligence reports, indicating that either such premises or some of the individuals therein were acting on behalf of the FMLN.

The guerrillas arbitrarily interfere with the lives of inhabitants in the conflictive zones, expropriating food and medical supplies, intercepting mail, and often forcing villagers to attend indoctrination sessions. They engage in forced recruitment either to fill their ranks or to obtain laborers and porters. FMLN committees exercise a high degree of control over the villages set up by refugees who return from camps in Honduras, an extension of their control inside those camps. The people usually comply with the FMLN demands, because the guerrillas regularly back up their threats by killing those who fail to cooperate.

g. Use of Excessive Force and Violations of Humanitarian Law in Internal Conflicts

There were new claims in 1989 of improper Air Force bombings near civilian populations that caused civilian deaths. Following President Duarte's 1984 guidelines, the Air Force claims to refrain from attacking guerrilla concentrations and installations when civilians are nearby. However, there are credible charges from people in the countryside which contradict this claim, especially in Chalatenango, Cabanas,

and Morazan departments, whe operations which received cl Force. There were no report of this activity in rural as

During the November FMLN off positions in the working classan Salvador, using innocenand Air Force counterattacks positions in civilian housis as command headquarters or confirmed by diplomatic off the guerrillas did not allow evacuate these areas. This shield and maximize the number to blame the ESAF for those

The Embassy estimates, base hospital and emergency orga: 200 and 400 civilian deaths and between 1,500 and 3,000 wounded received minor inju hospitalization. Most casu street fighting and the use arms, machine guns, grenade to have been caused by aeri

Charges of indiscriminate b FMLN urban offensive were no (AW) report noted that in t visited "the civilians had strafing and bombing were a emplacements." The ESAF fo Engagement (ROE) regarding offensive. The ROE allows : only when the mission is to activities. According to E civilian accounts, the Air helicopter strafing, rocket emplacements, which resulte However, despite initial ES several bombs on guerrilla Miguel. Both 500 and 250 pattacks caused some civilia

The guerrillas' use of unma landmines and booby traps i maiming among peasants. Pl around guerrilla-downed elemear water sources, in farm these mines killed 52 civil months of 1989.

Section 2 Respect for Civi

a. Freedom of Speech

There are no governmental reand the press. El Salvador regularly prints strongly a aftermath of the assassinat. Presidency, a series of str proposed in the National As impinged on freedom of specthe proposed law, President